

## Historic District Review Committee

### Staff Report

May 11, 2009

#### Action Items

**CAPP 2009-0006 Rogers Residence: Add Window in Rear Elevation in the Waterford Historic District. MCPI 303-16-3845.**

#### Background

The subject property, known as the Mahlon Schooley House, is a private home located at 15555 Second Street in the Village of Waterford. Built in 1817 by Mahlon Schooley, this side gable, two-story, brick building has three symmetrical bays, a stone foundation, and a metal roof. A rear ell addition with a double-tiered porch was added in the 1840s. In the late-nineteenth century, segmental arch windows were added in the south elevation and the front first story windows were lengthened. The former owners added a rear porch to the addition within the last 25 years. The Mahlon Schooley House is a contributing resource to the Waterford National Historic Landmark District.

The applicant proposes to add a window in the rear elevation of the ell addition to improve the light, view, and ventilation. The window will be in the second story above the rear porch and will mirror the window on the opposite side of an exterior brick chimney. The new window sash and surround will be replicated using the opposite window. Bricks removed from the opening will be reused to construct a brick jack arch above the new window and infill around the new frame. The mortar will match existing, using a Type O mortar consisting of one part cement, two parts lime, and eight parts sand. Mortar samples will be prepared, using pigments as necessary, to ensure that it matches the existing mortar in both color and texture. An experienced preservation contractor has been hired to undertake the project.

#### Analysis

##### Window

The Loudoun County Historic District Guidelines: Waterford Historic District (Waterford Guidelines) address windows in the Elements section of Guidelines for Existing Structures. The Guidelines advocate the avoidance of cutting new openings for windows under Inappropriate Treatments (Waterford Guidelines, Guidelines for Existing Structures: Elements: Inappropriate Treatments H.6., p. 103). However, the proposed new window is located in the rear of the house and will not be visible from the street. Additionally, the new window will match the existing window in the second story of the same elevation, which meets the guideline recommending that window construction should be based on old photographs, drawings, or examples (Waterford Guidelines, Guidelines for Existing Structures: Elements, Guidelines H.8., p. 105).

The Waterford Guidelines for windows provide specific guidance for replacing deteriorated window units. The following four criteria will be used to evaluate the proposed window unit: Design and Dimension of the Original Sash, Pane Configuration, Detailing, and Materials.

#### *Design and Dimension of the Original Sash*

The original size and shape of the sash should be maintained and the appearance of a double hung window should be retained. Additionally, the glass surface area should not be reduced. The proposed window will be replicated using the opposite and existing window in the second-story, rear elevation. Therefore, the original size, shape, double hung configuration, and glass surface area will match the existing and be appropriate to the house (Waterford Guidelines, Guidelines for Existing Structures: Elements, Guidelines H.7.a.i-iv., p. 104).

#### *Pane Configuration*

The number of panes and their arrangement in the existing window should be maintained. True divided lights are suggested to provide depth and profile to the windows. The existing window is a 9-over-6 light window. Since it will be replicated with true divided lights, the original pane number and arrangement as well as the window depth and profile will be maintained (Waterford Guidelines, Guidelines for Existing Structures: Elements, Guidelines H.7.b.i and H.7.b.ii., p. 104).

#### *Detailing*

The window should be finished in a historically appropriate paint color. The window will be painted white to match the existing windows in the house (Waterford Guidelines, Guidelines for Existing Structures: Elements, Guidelines H.7.c.i., p. 104).

#### *Materials*

Windows should be wood and glass should be transparent. The proposed new window will replicate an existing window in both materials, meeting the materials guideline (Waterford Guidelines, Guidelines for Existing Structures: Elements, Guidelines H.7.d.i and H.7.d.ii., p. 104).

Additionally, the window frame should be wood and should be matched in design. The new window frame will be wood and constructed using an existing window as an example, meeting the Waterford Guidelines for materials (Waterford Guidelines, Guidelines for Materials: Wood, Guidelines B.6. and B.7., p. 116).

#### Brick

The recommended treatments for brick are addressed in the Guidelines for Materials in the Waterford Guidelines. Masonry features important to defining the character of the building should be maintained. The brick jack arches above the windows is a character-defining feature in the Mahon Schooley House and will be incorporated into the new window opening. The brick removed from the new opening will be saved and used in the jack arch and around the new window frame. Reusing the brick meets the recommendation that the size, texture, color, and pattern of the brick should be

respected. The contractor will use a historically accurate mortar mixture and mix sample mortars using different pigments in order to match the historic material as recommended in the Waterford Guidelines (Waterford Guidelines, Guidelines for Materials: Stone and Brick, Guidelines C.1, C.2., and C.4, p. 123)

## Findings

1. The proposed new window opening is in the rear of the house and not visible from the public way.
2. Although the Waterford Guidelines recommend against new window openings, every effort to make this window appropriate to the house and the Waterford Historic District have been proposed.
3. The window will be replicated using an example from the house located in the same elevation and story.
4. The window unit's design and dimension of the sash, pane configuration, detailing, and materials meet the Waterford Guidelines.
5. The window frame's materials, design, and location meet the Waterford Guidelines.
6. Constructing a brick jack arch, a character-defining feature on the house, above the new window will help to blend the new opening into the historic building.
7. Reusing the brick and matching the mortar meet the Waterford Guidelines for materials.

## Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of the application.

## Suggested Motions

1. *I move that the Historic District Review Committee approve Certificate of Appropriateness 2009-0006 for the proposed new window in the second-story, rear elevation at 15555 Second Street in accordance with the Loudoun County Historic District Guidelines for the Waterford Historic and Cultural Conservation District based on the following findings...(see findings above).*
2. *I move that the Historic District Review Committee approve Certificate of Appropriateness 2009-0005 for the proposed new window in the second-story, rear elevation at 15555 Second Street in accordance with the Loudoun County Historic District Guidelines for the Waterford Historic and Cultural Conservation District based on the following findings (see findings above)....and the following conditions....*
3. *I move alternate motion...*

